

January 17, 1995

PRESIDENT ROBAK: Thank you, Senator Hall. The Chair recognizes Senator Chambers to speak to the Withem amendment.

SENATOR CHAMBERS: Madam President and members of the Legislature, the first thing I would comment on is the fact that all committee amendments are considered germane. I would like to ask Senator Withem a question.

PRESIDENT ROBAK: Senator Withem.

SENATOR CHAMBERS: Senator Withem, under the germaneness rule, isn't it true that all committee amendments are deemed to be germane?

SPEAKER WITHEM: You know, Senator Chambers, I know that's the folklore of the body. I have never been around when a decision has been asked on that question, nor do I find that stated specifically in the rules. I think it emanates from a provision in the rules that says that committees may combine bills together and that at one time, prior to my being in the body, there was a ruling from the Chair that that meant nongermane ideas could be put together. But I am...I know that's the folklore of the Legislature but I do not believe that our...I know our rules do not say that the committee amendments de facto are, in fact, germane.

SENATOR CHAMBERS: Thank you. Members of the Legislature, a rule one way or the other is needed if you want to avoid chaos. Out of chaos comes order. Some people believe if you get very deep philosophically, there can be no order without chaos. But I'm not going to go into all of that right now. But I will say this, there are times during the session when chaos is not only what I desire but which I enjoy, which I relish, which energizes me. But, again, since we're at the point where we're dealing with the drafting of rules, the body has to make a determination. There are two directions to go. The original proposed rule change offers one direction, that once an amendment in its entirety is ruled germane you cannot break out individual portions by way of a division of the question and have those individual components ruled to be not germane. Senator Withem is offering the other side of the coin that, despite the fact that the amendment as a whole is considered germane, once the question is divided, certain individual components may no longer be germane when taken as individual elements. Senator Withem's amendment would narrow the